

Highly Cited Articles. 39. Biochemistry Papers Published in the 1950s.

Number 25, June 20, 1977

We recently published a list of the 1950s citation classics in the physical and chemical sciences.¹ Here is the list of biochemical articles. The biological, medical, and behavioral classics will follow shortly.

Each article was cited at least 500 times in the 15 year period from 1961 to 1975. Taking the entire universe of published articles into account, only about one in 20,000--or 0.005%--receives so many citations.

In February we published a list of highly cited biochemical articles published in the 1940s.² That list of 89 items, like the 1930s life sciences list,³ which was composed primarily of biochemical articles, reflected one of the basic concerns of biochemistry--the analysis of phosphorus and its physiologic compounds. Some of the 78 highly-cited biochemical articles of the 1950s, listed in Figure 1, continue to reflect the importance of research into phosphorus determination. Phosphorus is basic to the study of DNA, sugars, lipids, and other biochemical substances.

Of the 78 articles in Figure 1, 25 have received over 1,000 citations, and 13 over 2,000. The majority of these papers concern methodology. This should come as no surprise to

biochemists themselves, many of whom acknowledge that methods are the backbone of all scientific research. David Gillespie of the National Cancer Institute discussed the process by which a method paper becomes a "classic."⁴ He commented that "the distinction between a classic and a quickly outmoded method lies in the ability of the investigators to see the uses to which the method will be put and evaluate particular parameters accordingly and, as importantly, to take heed of the little irregularities that lead to significant improvements."

The importance of methods papers is also emphasized by Karl Piez, Chief of the Laboratory of Biochemistry of the National Institute of Dental Research. His highly-cited 1960 paper⁵ modified the methodological procedure of the 1950s paper of Spackman, Stein, and Moore (66). Piez commented that their method was "a highly developed method and one of the most important procedures in modern biochemistry...."⁶ Still, Piez was compelled, for the purposes of his own biochemical investigations, to modify the procedure. This illustrates the nature of biochemical advances. Both papers have now achieved very

Figure 1. Highly cited articles in biochemistry published in the 1950s. A = item number. B = total citations 1961-1975. C = average yearly citations 1961-1975. D = citations in 1974. E = citations in 1975. Articles are listed alphabetically by first author.

A	B	C	D	E	Bibliographic Data
1.	2791	186	294	281	Bartlett G R. Phosphorus assay in column chromatography. <i>J. Biol. Chem.</i> 234 :466-68, 1959.
2.	686	46	30	25	Bennett H S & Luft J H. Collidine as a basis for buffering fixatives. <i>J. Biophys. Biochem. Cytol.</i> 6 :113-17, 1959.
3.	779	52	52	44	Bertler A, Carlsson A & Rosengren E. A method for the fluorometric determination of adrenaline and noradrenaline in tissues. <i>Acta Physiol. Scand.</i> 44 :273-92, 1958.
4.	1830	122	253	264	Bligh E G & Dyer W J. A rapid method of total lipid extraction and purification. <i>Canad. J. Biochem. Physiol.</i> 37 :911-17, 1959.
5.	1123	75	42	61	Boas N F. Method for the determination of hexosamines in tissues. <i>J. Biol. Chem.</i> 204 :553-63, 1953.
6.	506	34	35	28	Bodanszky M & duVigneaud V. A method of synthesis of long peptide chains using a synthesis of oxytocin as an example. <i>J. Amer. Chem. Soc.</i> 81 :5688-91, 1959.
7.	1203	80	69	73	Boyer P D. Spectrophotometric study of the reaction of protein sulphhydryl groups with organic mercurials. <i>J. Amer. Chem. Soc.</i> 76 :4331-37, 1954.
8.	918	61	28	24	Brown J B. A chemical method for the determination of oestriol, oestrone and oestradiol in human urine. <i>Biochem. J.</i> 60 :185-93, 1955.
9.	5037	336	541	506	Burton K. A study of the conditions and mechanism of the diphenylamine reaction for the colorimetric estimation of deoxy-ribonucleic acid. <i>Biochem. J.</i> 62 :315-23, 1956.
10.	934	62	22	21	Bush I E. Methods of paper chromatography of steroids applicable to the study of steroids in mammalian blood and tissues. <i>Biochem. J.</i> 50 :370-78, 1952.
11.	564	38	32	16	Cahn R S, Ingold C K & Prelog V. A specification of asymmetric configuration in organic chemistry. <i>Experientia</i> 12 :81-124, 1956.
12.	506	34	34	26	Carlsson A & Waldeck S. A fluorometric method for the determination of dopamine (3-hydroxytyramine). <i>Acta Physiol. Scand.</i> 44 :293-98, 1958.
13.	1109	74	34	25	Caulfield J B. Effects of varying the vehicle for OsO ₄ in tissue fixation. <i>J. Biophys. Biochem. Cytol.</i> 3 :827-29, 1957.
14.	550	37	31	53	Cerioti G. A microchemical determination of deoxyribonucleic acid. <i>J. Biol. Chem.</i> 198 :297-303, 1952.
15.	721	48	42	47	Cerioti G. Determination of nucleic acids in animal tissues. <i>J. Biol. Chem.</i> 214 :59-70, 1955.

Figure 1 continued

- | | | | | | |
|-----|------|-----|-----|-----|--|
| 16. | 1984 | 132 | 225 | 225 | Chen P S Jr., Toribara T Y & Warner H. Microdetermination of phosphorus. <i>Analyt. Chem.</i> 28:1756-58, 1956. |
| 17. | 1097 | 73 | 115 | 128 | Dixon M. The determination of enzyme inhibitor constants. <i>Biochemical J.</i> 55:170-71, 1953. |
| 18. | 2705 | 180 | 133 | 94 | Dole V P. A relation between non-esterified fatty acids in plasma and the metabolism of glucose. <i>J. Clin. Invest.</i> 35:150-54, 1956. |
| 19. | 2732 | 182 | 367 | 334 | Dubois M, Gilles K A, Hamilton J K, Rebers P A & Smith F. Colorimetric method for determination of sugars and related substances. <i>Analyt. Chem.</i> 28:350-56, 1956. |
| 20. | 2255 | 150 | 217 | 147 | Eagle H. Amino acid metabolism in mammalian cell cultures. <i>Science</i> 130:432-37, 1959. |
| 21. | 2216 | 148 | 237 | 262 | Ellman G L. Tissue sulfhydryl groups. <i>Arch. Biochem. Biophys.</i> 82:70-77, 1959. |
| 22. | 557 | 37 | 24 | 28 | Folch J, Ascolli I, Lees M, Meath J A & LeBaron F N. Preparation of lipid extracts from brain tissue. <i>J. Biol. Chem.</i> 191:833, 1951. |
| 23. | 7454 | 497 | 776 | 706 | Folch J, Lees M & Sloane-Stanley G H. A simple method for the isolation and purification of total lipides from animal tissues. <i>J. Biol. Chem.</i> 226:497-509, 1957. |
| 24. | 612 | 41 | 67 | 43 | Gianetto R & deDuve C. Tissue fractionation studies. IV. Comparative study of the binding of acid phosphatase, beta-glucuronidase and cathepsin by rat-liver particles. <i>Biochem. J.</i> 59:433-38, 1955. |
| 25. | 611 | 41 | 42 | 43 | Glock G E & McLean P. Further studies on the properties and assay of glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase and 6-phosphogluconate dehydrogenase of rat liver. <i>Biochem. J.</i> 55:400-08, 1953. |
| 26. | 1193 | 80 | 65 | 83 | Hirs C H W. The oxidation of ribonuclease with performic acid. <i>J. Biol. Chem.</i> 219:611-21, 1956. |
| 27. | 619 | 41 | 26 | 20 | Hirsch J & Anrens E J, Jr. The separation of complex lipid mixtures by the use of silicic acid chromatography. <i>J. Biol. Chem.</i> 233:311-20, 1958. |
| 28. | 597 | 40 | 46 | 49 | Hohorst H J, Kreuz F H & Bucher T. Metabolitgehalte und Metabolitkonzentrationen in der Leber der Ratte (Metabolite content and concentration in rat liver). <i>Biochem. Zschr.</i> 332:18-46, 1959. |
| 29. | 580 | 39 | 22 | 14 | Hough L, Jones J K N & Wadman W H. Quantitative analysis of mixtures of sugars by the method of partition chromatography. V. Improved methods for the separation and detection of the sugars and their methylated derivatives on the paper chromatogram. <i>J. Chem. Soc.</i> p. 1702-6, 1950. |
| 30. | 639 | 43 | 27 | 20 | Huckabee W E. Relationships of pyruvate and lactate during anaerobic metabolism. I. Effects of infusion of pyruvate or glucose and of hyperventilation. <i>J. Clin. Invest.</i> 37:244-54, 1958. |

Figure 1 continued

31. 768 51 57 60 **Huggett A S G & Nixon D A.** Use of glucose oxidase, peroxidase and o-dianisidine in determination of blood and urinary glucose. *Lancet* 2:368-70, 1957.
32. 767 51 27 20 **Hurlbert R E, Schmitz H, Brumm A & Patter V R.** Nucleotide metabolism. II. Chromatographic separation of acid-soluble nucleotides. *J. Biol. Chem.* 209:23-39, 1954.
33. 619 41 29 33 **Katz A M, Dreyer W J & Anfinsen C B.** Peptide separation by two-dimensional chromatography and electrophoresis. *J. Biol. Chem.* 234:2897-2900, 1959.
34. 896 60 92 90 **Kauzmann W.** Some factors in the interpretation of protein denaturation. *Adv. Protein Chem.* 14:1-63, 1959.
35. 766 51 30 29 **Kay E R M, Simmons N S & Dounce A L.** An improved preparation of sodium desoxyribonucleate. *J. Amer. Chem. Soc.* 74:1724-26, 1952.
36. 776 52 52 57 **Kellenberger E, Ryter A & Sechaud J.** Electron microscope study of DNA-containing plasms. II. Vegetative and mature phase DNA as compared with normal bacterial nucleoids in different physiological states. *J. Biophys. Biochem. Cytol.* 4:671-78, 1958.
37. 672 45 20 20 **Kirby K S.** A new method for the isolation of ribonucleic acids from mammalian tissues. *Biochem. J.* 64:405-8, 1956
38. 805 54 102 136 **Layne E.** Spectrophotometric and turbidimetric methods for measuring proteins. I. Turbidimetric methods. *Methods Enzym.* 3:447-49, 1957.
39. 50016 3334 7075 6842 **Lowry O H, Rosebrough N J, Farr A L & Randall R J.** Protein measurement with the Folin phenol reagent. *J. Biol. Chem.* 193:256-65, 1951.
40. 712 47 24 27 **Markert C L & Mollner F.** Multiple forms of enzymes; tissue, ontogenetic, and species specific patterns. *P. Nat. Acad. Sci. USA* 45:753-63, 1959.
41. 585 39 21 14 **Markham R & Smith J D.** The structure of nucleic acids. I. Cyclic nucleotides produced by ribonuclease and by alkaline hydrolysis. *Biochem. J.* 52:552-57, 1952.
42. 540 36 11 10 **Marshall J D, Eveland W C & Smith C W.** Superiority of fluorescein isothiocyanate (Riggs) for fluorescent-antibody technic with a modification of its application. *P. Soc. Exp. Biol. Med.* 98:898-900, 1958.
43. 513 34 62 67 **McFarlane A S.** Efficient trace-labelling of proteins with iodine. *Nature* 182:53, 1958.
44. 579 39 21 21 **Meselson M, Stahl F W & Vinograd J.** Equilibrium sedimentation of macromolecules in density gradients. *P. Nat. Acad. Sci. USA* 43:581-83, 1957.
45. 519 35 91 69 **Miller G L.** Protein determination for large numbers of samples. *Analyt. Chemistry* 31:964, 1959.
46. 665 44 20 16 **Moffitt W & Yang J.** The optical rotary dispersion of simple polypeptides. *P. Nat. Acad. Sci. USA* 42:596-602, 1956.

Figure 1 continued

47. 1368 91 74 57 **Moore S & Stein W H.** A modified ninhydrin reagent for the photometric determination of amino acids and related compounds. *J. Biol. Chem.* 211:907-13, 1954.
48. 1475 98 55 65 **Moore S, Spackman D H & Stein W H.** Chromatography of amino acids on sulfonated polystyrene resins. *Analyt. Chem.* 30:1185-90, 1958.
49. 1041 69 61 47 **Nachlas M M, Tsou K, DeSousa E, Cheng C & Seligman A M.** Cytochemical demonstration of succinic dehydrogenase by the use of a new p-nitrophenyl substituted diterzole. *J. Histochem. Cytochem.* 5:420-36, 1957.
50. 706 47 124 106 **Nash T.** The colorimetric estimation of formaldehyde by means of the Hantzsch reaction. *Biochem. J.* 55:416-21, 1953.
51. 570 38 16 16 **Neuman R E & Logan M A.** The determination of hydroxyproline. *J. Biol. Chem.* 184:229-306, 1950.
52. 664 44 26 16 **Ogur M & Rosen G.** The nucleic acids of plant tissues. I. The extraction and estimation of desoxypentose nucleic acid and pentose nucleic acid. *Arch. Biochem. Biophys.* 25:262-76, 1950.
53. 941 63 25 14 **Peterson E A & Sober H A.** Chromatography of proteins. I. Cellulose ion-exchange adsorbents. *J. Amer. Chem. Soc.* 78:751-55, 1956.
54. 564 38 12 12 **Peterson R E, Karrer A & Guerra S L.** Evaluation of Silber-Porter procedure for determination of plasma hydrocortisone. *Analyt. Chem.* 29:144-49, 1957.
55. 1242 83 85 82 **Porter R R.** The hydrolysis of rabbit gamma-globulin and antibodies with crystalline papain. *Biochem. J.* 73:119-26, 1959.
56. 728 49 52 61 **Reissig J L, Strominger J L & Leloir L F.** A modified colorimetric method for the estimation of N-acetyl amino sugars. *J. Biol. Chem.* 217:959-66, 1955.
57. 604 40 36 36 **Rondle C J M & Morgan W T J.** The determination of glucosamine and galactosamine. *Biochem. J.* 61:586-89, 1955.
58. 845 56 52 41 **Rosen H.** A modified ninhydrin colorimetric analysis for amino acids. *Arch. Biochem. Biophys.* 67:10-15, 1957.
59. 694 46 59 63 **Schwert G W & Takenaka Y.** A spectrophotometric determination of trypsin and chymotrypsin. *Biochim. Biophys. Acta.* 16:570-75, 1955.
60. 733 49 41 51 **Seifter S, Dayton S, Novic B & Muntwyler E.** The estimation of glycogen with the anthrone reagent. *Arch. Biochem. Biophys.* 25:191-200, 1950.
61. 647 43 38 27 **Sheehan J C & Hess G P.** A new method for forming peptide bonds. *J. Amer. Chem. Soc.* 77:1067-68, 1955.
62. 586 39 52 37 **Simon E J & Shemin D.** The preparation of S-succinyl coenzyme A. *J. Amer. Chem. Soc.* 75:2520, 1953.

Figure 1 continued

63. 752 50 38 31 **Skou J C.** The influence of some cations on an adenosine triphosphatase from peripheral nerves. *Biochim. Biophys. Acta* **23**:394-401, 1957.
64. 2041 136 49 56 **Smithies O.** Zone electrophoresis in starch gels: group variations in the serum proteins of normal human adults. *Biochem. J.* **61**:629-41, 1955.
65. 1439 96 99 81 **Somogyi M.** Notes on sugar determination. *J. Biol. Chem.* **195**:19-23, 1952.
66. 5727 382 450 438 **Spackman D H, Stein W H & Moore S.** Automatic recording apparatus for use in the chromatography of amino acids. *Analyt. Chem.* **30**:1190-1206, 1958.
67. 562 37 55 52 **Spizizen J.** Transformation of biochemically deficient strains of *Bacillus subtilis* by deoxyribonucleate. *P. Nat. Acad. Sci. USA* **44**:1072-78, 1958.
68. 701 47 63 65 **Svennerholm L.** Quantitative estimation of sialic acids. II. A colorimetric resorcinol-hydrochloric acid method. *Biochim. Biophys. Acta* **74**:604-11, 1957.
69. 561 37 54 57 **Tausky H H & Schorr E.** A microcolorimetric method for the determination of inorganic phosphorus. *J. Biol. Chem.* **202**:675-85, 1953.
70. 725 48 41 36 **Tiselius A, Hjerten S & Levin O.** Protein chromatography on calcium phosphate columns. *Arch. Biochem. Biophys.* **65**:132-55, 1956.
71. 2244 150 185 140 **Trevelyan W E, Procter D P & Harrison J S.** Detection of sugars on paper chromatograms. *Nature* **166**:444-45, 1950.
72. 823 55 114 91 **Vogel H J.** Acetylornithinase of *Escherichia coli*; partial purification and some properties. *J. Biol. Chem.* **218**:97-106, 1956.
73. 2656 177 282 293 **Warren L.** The thiobarbituric acid assay of sialic acids. *J. Biol. Chem.* **234**:1971-75, 1959.
74. 552 37 19 16 **Watson J D & Crick F H C.** A structure for deoxyribose nucleic acid. *Nature* **171**:737-38, 1953.
75. 2509 137 214 181 **Watson M L.** Staining of tissue sections for electron microscopy with heavy metals. *J. Biophys. Biochem. Cytol.* **4**:475-79, 1958.
76. 767 51 18 10 **Wyatt G R.** The purine and pyrimidine composition of deoxy-pentose nucleic acids. *Biochem. J.* **48**:584-90, 1951.
77. 541 36 15 11 **Yarmolinsky M B & dela Haba G L.** Inhibition by puromycin of amino acid incorporation into protein. *P. Nat. Acad. Sci. USA* **45**:1721-29, 1959.
78. 741 49 45 47 **Yemm E W & Cocking E C.** The determination of amino acids with ninhydrin. *Analyst* **80**:209-13, 1955.

high citation rates.

On the other hand, the article by Watson and Crick (74) may be indicative of what is called the "obliteration phenomenon."⁷ Many important scientific discoveries are quickly incorporated into the common wisdom of the field. Authors no longer feel compelled to cite the original discovery. Compared to the citation rates for other classics on the list, and considering the enormous amount of research in molecular biology, the Watson and Crick paper will probably soon become obliterated. In the period 1961-1975, it received only 552 citations--a yearly average of 37. In 1975 it was cited "only" 16 times. Few other papers in Figure 1 have registered such sharp decreases.

Many of the papers on this list are citation superstars--Lowry (39) with 50,016 citations; Folch (23) with 7,454; Burton (9) with 5,037; and Bartlett (1) with 2,791. All of these have 1974 and 1975 citation rates well above their yearly averages, indicating that activity in these fields has increased in recent years.

Six authors of these 1950s articles also appeared on our 1940s list with method papers: Lowry (39), Markham and Smith (41), Moore and Stein (47, 48, and 66), and Tausky (69). Those by Markham and Smith, and Moore and Stein, concerned chromatographic techniques.

Eleven of these articles have been authored by 11 Nobel laureates. Watson of the U.S. and Crick of England (74) shared the Nobel Prize for medicine in 1962. Tiselius of Sweden (70) received the 1948 Prize in chemistry for his discovery and isolation of mouse paralysis virus. In

1972 Porter of Britain (55) received the medical Prize for research on the chemical structure and nature of antibodies. The 1970 Nobel Prize for chemistry was awarded to Leloir of Argentina (56) for his discovery of sugar nucleotides and their role in the biosynthesis of carbohydrates. For his research into the inner workings of living cells, deDuve of the U.S. (24) received the 1974 Nobel Prize for medicine. The 1975 Prize for chemistry was awarded to Prelog of Switzerland (11), a native of Yugoslavia, for his research on the structure of bio-

Figure 2. Journals that published the highly cited 1950s articles listed in Figure 1, according to number of articles. A = number of articles. (Present titles of some journals are given in parenthesis.)

A	Journals
18	J. Biol. Chemistry
14	Biochemical Journal
6	Analytical Chemistry
6	J. Amer. Chem. Soc.
5	Arch. Biochem. Biophys.
5	Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci. USA
4	J. Biophys. Biochem. (J. Cell Bio.)
3	Biochim. Biophys. Acta
3	Nature
2	J. Clin. Invest.
1	Acta Physiol. Scand.
1	Adv. Protein Chem.
1	Analyst
1	Biochem. Zschr. (Eur. J. Biochemistry)
1	Canadian J. Biochem. Physiol.
1	Experientia
1	J. Chem. Soc.
1	J. Histochem. Cytochem.
1	Lancet
1	Methods Enzymol.
1	Proc. Soc. Exp. Biol. Med.
1	Science

logical molecules. In 1955 duVigneaud of the U.S. (6) received the chemistry Prize for his work on pituitary hormones. Three other Americans, Anfinsen (33), Moore and Stein (47, 48, and 66) shared the 1972 chemistry Prize for their pioneering studies on enzymes.

Figure 2 lists the 22 journals that published these articles. Just two journals published 32 of the 78 articles. The *Journal of Biological Chemistry* published 18 articles, and the *Biochemical Journal* 14. *Analytical Chemistry* and the *Journal of the American Chemical Society* published 6 each. All but 3 of the articles authored by Nobelists appeared in these four journals, which accounted for 56% (44 articles) of the papers in Figure 1.

The great majority of these 78 articles were published in the latter half of the 1950s. From 1950-1954, 23 articles were published. The remaining 55 articles appeared from 1955-

1959, with increasing frequency by the years. In the late 1940s and early 1950s there was a tremendous amount of research done on the structural elements of DNA. Both Watson⁸ and Crick⁹ have acknowledged that at the time of their own efforts numerous other investigators were active. The success and impact of their work helps explain the flurry of activity in biochemistry in the mid to late 1950s--with a little monetary help from our friends in Washington and elsewhere.

Much of the methodological groundwork for the 1950s biochemical research--such as chromatography and its application to nucleic acids--had been laid in previous decades. In the same way, these classic papers of the 1950s helped lay the foundation for biochemical research today. In particular, the discovery of DNA and its capacity for carrying genetic material has led science to a more complete understanding of the mysteries of life.

REFERENCES

1. Garfield, E. Highly cited articles. 38. Physics and chemistry papers published in the 1950s. *Current Contents*[®] No. 23, 6 June 1977, p. 5-9.
2. -----, Highly cited articles. 35. Biochemistry papers published in the 1940s. *Current Contents* No. 8, 21 February 1977, p. 5-11.
3. -----, Citation classics. 2. Articles from the life sciences 1930-1939. *Current Contents* No. 43, 25 October 1976, p. 5-10.
4. Gillespie D. Citation classics. A quantitative assay for DNA-RNA hybrids with DNA immobilized on a membrane. *Current Contents* No. 11, 14 March 1977, p. 14.
5. Piez K A & Morris L. A modified procedure for the automatic analysis of amino acid. *Analytical Biochemistry* 1:187-201, 1960.
6. Piez K A. Personal communication, 18 January 1977.
7. Garfield E. The 'obliteration phenomenon' in science, and the advantage of being obliterated. *Current Contents* No. 51/52, 22 December 1975, p. 5-7.
8. Watson J D. *The double helix: being a personal account of the discovery of the structure of DNA*. New York: Atheneum, 1968.
9. Olby R. *The path to the double helix*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1974.