Forty-two subjects in whom the diagnosis of Wilson's disease was established based on biochemical criteria were treated with penicillamine. All remained asymptomatic during a period of observation of 142 patient-years. An estimate based on the natural history of Wilson's disease suggested that symptoms could have been expected to develop in at least eight of the subjects. [The SCI indicates that this paper has been cited in more than 225 publications.]

Prevention of Wilson's Disease

Irmin Sternlieb
Albert Einstein College of Medicine
Bronx, NY 10461
and
I. Herbert Scheinberg
National Center for the Study of Wilson's Disease
New York, NY 10019

In 1947 Wilson's disease was a curious, neurological and hepatic syndrome that was diagnosable only by clinical examination and was invariably fatal by adolescence or soon thereafter. Over the next decade five discoveries led to diagnoasibility—by biochemical criteria alone; and treatability—by four pills daily.

First, in 1948, C.G. Holmberg and C.B. Laurell, in Sweden, discovered a normal blue protein of plasma that contained several atoms of prosthetic copper. Second, in the same year J.N. Cummings, in Britain, finding large excesses of copper in the brains and livers of patients, suggested that this copper was probably the etiologic agent that caused the disease and that its removal by British antilewisite might be therapeutic.

Third, in 1952, I.H. Scheinberg and D. Gitlin, in the US, reported that deficiency of ceruloplasmin appeared to be diagnostic of Wilson's disease, though this deficiency alone soon proved not to be a sufficient diagnostic criterion. Fourth, as a result of G. Menghini's development in Italy of a needle that made hepatic biopsy safe and feasible, a ceruloplasmin of <20 mg/dl and a hepatic copper >250 μg/g dry weight appeared to be a pair of criteria sufficient for the diagnosis— even in the absence of symptoms.

Finally, in 1956 J.M. Walshe, working in the US and Britain, discovered that penicillamine was safe and effective oral therapy for Wilson's disease.

Over the next several years we realized that these discoveries might make it possible to prolong the asymptomatic state indefinitely. Indeed, by 1968 we thought we had proved that they could. We submitted our proof to the New England Journal of Medicine.

The Journals reviewing statisticians, however, said in effect that the paper was un publishable because we had not proven that low ceruloplasmin and high copper are unequivocally diagnostic of Wilson's disease, and, therefore, we should have treated half of our patients with a placebo. But we hadn't even considered using patients as placebo controls when we began treating asymptomatic patients because we were convinced they were suffering from a disease that—without chelation therapy—had been proven to be unavoidably fatal by 36 years of clinical experience. Moreover, our certainty of the diagnosis of Wilson's disease in our patients was strengthened by the fact that almost all of them had a sibling whose Wilson's disease had been confirmed clinically or at autopsy.

We revised our manuscript three times to escape this impasse, but failed to satisfy the Journal's reviewers, or its editorial staff— except for Franz Ingelfinger, the editor. He overruled reviewers and staff, publishing the manuscript accompanied by an editorial— "Editor's Choice"— that read, in part: "Sternlieb and Scheinberg's manuscript has been seen by at least four clinicians conversant with liver disease, by two expert epidemiologists and by three biostatisticians. It has been discussed repeatedly and at length by the editorial staff; one editor [Ingelfinger himself, a fact he omitted] even traveled to New York for a personal confrontation with one of the authors. . . . The Journals' advisers in matters epidemiologic and statistical, however, remained unconvinced. . . and, Ingelfinger concluded. . . it was time to publish the manuscript. The critical reader must judge for himself."

Almost 25 years later Ingelfinger's choice has been proven wise. The pharmacologic prevention of symptomatic Wilson's disease is now generally accepted wisdom.

(Cited 280 times.)
[See also Walshe J M. Citation Classic. Current Contents/Lite Science 26(37):21. 12 September 1983.]

Received November 25, 1992

CURRENT CONTENTS® ©1993 by ISI®